

## Effective Factors in Realizing the Achievements and Failures of Hamid Karzai administration العوامل المؤثرة في تحقيق إنجازات إدارة حامد كرزاي وإخفاقاتها

مظفر مظهر (\*) Mozaffar Mazhar

مرتضی دهقان نژاد <sup>(\*\*)</sup> Morteza Dehqannejad

د. أبو الحسن فياض أنوش (\*\*\*\*) Dr. Abolhassan fayyaz Anush

### تاريخ القبول: 18-6-2024



تاريخ الإرسال: 6-6-2024

### Abstract

The present study is meant to explain the effective factors in realizing the achievements and failures of Hamid

Karzai administration. According to the historical evidence, Karzai administration has been relatively successful in providing basic services such as security, justice and welfare; but, even with the support of the international community and the aid of the United States of America, it could not create a government that would satisfy Afghans and donor countries. Therefore, addressing this issue is of fundamental importance.

The main question is, what factors have played a major role in realizing the achievements and failures of Karzai administration? The hypothesis of the article is that: the thirteen-year administration of Hamid Karzai, with the cash assistance of the United States and coalition member countries, was able to bring

PhD student of Islamic Iran History, Department of History, University of Esfahan Email:mozaffar.mazhar2@gmail.com \* طالب دكتوراه في تاريخ إيران الإسلاميّة، قسم التاريخ، جامعة أصفهان- إيران.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Assistant professor, Department of History, University of Esfahan, Corresponding author Email: mdehqannejad@yahoo.com

أستاذ مساعد، قسم التاريخ، جامعة أصفهان، إيران ( الكاتب المسؤول)

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> Associate professor, Department of History, University of Esfahan Email: amir.anush2016@gmail.com أستاذ مشارك، قسم التاريخ، جامعة أصفهان- إيران.

### بجتلة الآداث والعلو مرالانستانيتة

about relative changes in the military, education, human rights, democracy, freedom of speech, and women's rights sectors. But the lack of a clear policy and the weakness of the idea of national unity, the regional countries interference, failure in management of foreign aids, and failure in fighting administrative corruption, against ثلاثة عشر عامًا، بمساعدة مالية من الولايات المتحدة ودول التحالف الأعضاء، تمكنت من إحداث تغييرات نسبية في المجالات العسكرية والتعليمية وحقوق الإنسان والديمقراطية وحرية التعبير وحقوق المرأة لكن عدم وجود سياسة واضحة وضعف فكرة الوحدة الوطنية، وتدخلات دول المنطقة، وغياب إدارة المساعدات الخارجية، وعدم مكافحة الفساد الإدارى، كانت العقبات الأساسية في تقدم حكومته، حيث تُعد هذه القضايا هي من عوامل فشل حكمه. تم توضيح هذه المقالة بالاعتماد على البحث المكتبى والطريقة الوصفية-التحليلية.

الكلمات المفتاحية: أفغانستان، الحكم، حامد كرزاي، الإنجازات، الإخفاقات.

### Introduction

Hamid Karzai was appointed as the head of the interim government (1380 AH) when the government had fallen apart in Afghanistan; there were no three powers and no security forces.

were the main obstacles in the path of his progress, and these are among the factors of its governance failure. This article is written using library research with descriptive-analytical method.

**Keywords:** Afghanistan, Governance, Hamid Karzai, Achievements, Failures الملخص: تهدف الدّراسة الحاليّة إلى بيان العوامل المؤثرة في تحقيق إنجازات وإخفاقات حكومة حامد كرزاي ووفاقًا للأدلة التّاريخيّة، فإن حكومة كرزاى حققت نجاحًا نسبيًّا في توفير الخدمات الأساسية مثل الأمن والعدالة والرعاية الاجتماعية، ولـم يتمكن مـن تشكيل حكومة ترضى الأفغان والدول المانحة حتى بوجود دعم المجتمع الدولى ومساعدة الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية ولذلك فإن معالجة هذه القضية لها الأهمية الأساسية للقضية المذكورة.

السؤال الأساسي هو، ما هي العوامل التى لعبت دوراً كبيراً فى تحقيق إنجازات وإخفاقات حكومة كرزاى؟ فرضية المقال هى أن حكومة حامد كرزاى التى استمرت The country's economy was destroyed due to civil wars, banks were looted and empty, and the Afghan money was less valid than the Pakistani rupee in the country's daily business affairs. Anarchy and lack of security prevailed

### ٳ ٳٷڂڵڨ؞۬ؿٵڵڣؾؖ*ڹ*ۯ

in all parts of Afghanistan. In short, all political, economic, administrative and legal structures of the country were destroyed and messed up. Feudalism was prevalent in the society, every commander and warlord ruled the region under his control with violence, and the people were in a miserable state. At that time, there was a need for a powerful government with broad bases, knowledgeable, experienced and patriotic staff who consider the interests of the people and the country. In particular, in the Bonn conference, the international community, with commitments of extensive economic aids for the reconstruction of Afghanistan, placed many duties and responsibilities on the new government, including the duties of bringing peace, creating an administrative system, fighting against terrorism, drug cultivation and trafficking and other problems of the society of Afghanistan.

Therefore, the main question of this research is what factors played a major role in the achievements and failures of Karzai administration? The hypothesis of the article is that: the thirteen-year administration of Hamid Karzai, with the cash assistance of the United States and coalition member countries, was able to bring about some changes in the military, education, human rights, democracy, freedom of speech and women's rights sectors. But due to the lack of a clear policy and national thought, factors such as the regional countries interference, failure in management of foreign aids, and failure in fighting against administrative corruption, the progress of his administration was hindered. One of the important goals of the current research is to explain the effective factors of the achievements and failures of Hamid Karzai administration, which has been expressed analytically and descriptively. The data were collected using library and internet sources, articles and portals of the news agency in Persian language.

### A general view of the structure of the Afghan system before the rule of Hamid Karzai

The social structure of the Afghan society, which is mainly based on ethnicities and tribes, has affected the political geography of the parties. In the first days of the fall of Dr. Najib's government (1371 AH), there were some party governments in Kabul, each of which claimed comprehensive sovereignty over the city (Arezou, 2003: 23).

Political and military factions, in the form of ethnic and religious formations, each took over the administration of a

### بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنسانية

part of the city and put expansionism at the top of their plans. Shiites, in the form of two political parties, Islamic Unity and Islamic Movement, mainly took over the western parts of Kabul. While Jamiat-e-Islami Party, Hezb-e-Islami, Hezb-e Wahdat-e Islami and the Movement Party led by General Dostum had divided the other parts of the city among themselves. In the civil wars, which started from the moment of victory of the Mujahideen in Kabul, mainly four ethnically incompatible forces with their own tendencies were facing each other. The division of forces was mostly formed according to ethnicity and religion. (Ayeezh, 2005: 3).

In 1373 AH, there were four military forces fighting for political power in Kabul. Each of these groups had an ethnic basis. The theory of competition between parties and elites analyzes the politicization of the phenomenon of ethnicity and religion as a tool for mobilizing the masses of people in the scene of power-seeking conflicts (Emami, 1999: 32). In this view, the traditional composition and structure of the society, in which only the political sovereignty of a certain nation has political legitimacy, is faced with new manifestations of the increasing demands for participation of the nations. Therefore, the people's

demand for their rights revolts and is not willing to submit and obey a certain ethnic group (Ansari, 2003: 1). The result of this intersection is the collision of two opposing attitudes, each of which has emerged in a specific political front and is manifested in the civil wars (Rasoul, 2005: 3).

The forces composed of nonruling ethnic groups were seriously pursuing their demands for political participation in the given opportunity and were afraid of returning to the unjust past; because the era of Jihad emphasized the national composition of the Afghan society and did not allow the reputation of a particular tribe to overshadow the presence of other tribes, that is, ethnic diversity in the country (Bakhtiari, 2006: 4).

Confronting the aggressor enemy, in the light of Islamic thoughts, was manifested in the form of the common prestige of all Afghan tribes, and for the first time in the history of the country, there was the talk of common heritage and national history. Thus, the first serious confrontation was formed between the flag bearers of ruling Pashtun history and other ethnic groups. According to the Peshawar Accord (on 24 April 1992) it was decided that Sibghatullah Mojadidi would serve as the head and representative of the Mujahideen

# ٳۊؘۻٳڡؿؾٳڣؾۣؠ

government for two months, and after that, Rabbani would be the head of the government for four months; but from the first days of his arrival Mujahideen to Kabul, the civil wars of the parties, especially the Hekmatyar Party against Rabbani, began (Seraj, 2010: 4).

The tribal structure and indigenous culture of Afghan society turns historical facts into painful and tense events under the ethnocentric slogans of the parties. A certain group and category is no longer condemned to political monopoly. In this social structure and with the tribal political attitudes, people determine the level of political participation and political deprivation of the tribes. In such a situation, if some political elites lag behind their rivals in the competition, ethnic politics interprets this individual failure in the form of political exclusion of a nation and political group, and finally, it expands the scope of ethnic conflicts and continues the social violence (Karwal, 2005: 8).

While Hekmatyar considered ethnic interests to be secured only by himself and his party's undisputed rule, Massoud and Rabbani looked at non-Tajik groups with suspicion. As long as the leaders of Wahdat party saw their political interests with Massoud, they made an agreement with him and when the situation changed, they condemned

XC

him as sectarianism and fascism and formed a coordination council with Hekmatyar, their irreconcilable enemy (Sajjadi, 2010: 23).

After 1371 AH in Kabul, the obvious traces of such a culture were revealed. Regardless of the external causes and factors of these wars and the political factors affecting them, from the perspective of the current discussion, that is, ethnic and religious conflicts, we can find evidence and reasons for the effects of ethnicity and religious issues on the war policies of various parties and power spectrums in Kabul (Heravi, 2017: 8).

# Political legitimacy and the government after 1380 AH

Afghanistan after 1380 is undoubtedly different than before. The people of Afghanistan, after years of heavy civil wars and the harmful consequences it brought to all the citizens of the country, are tired of widespread sectarianism and they want to live peacefully together as fellow citizens and fellow countrymen in the light of accepting each other and believing in social and political pluralism (Qureishi, 2004: 8).

The element of religion or Islam has been and will be prominent in all the political spaces of Afghanistan because Islam is accepted by all Afghan people.

### بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنسانية

As mentioned, religion or Islam is one of the important sources of political legitimacy in Afghanistan. When the people of Afghanistan feel that the ruler of the country and the political system they obey, act on the basis of Islamic orders, the ruler and system have political legitimacy. But if they feel that the rulers and the political system are un-Islamic and act in contradiction with religious orders and norms, that political system will face the challenge of political legitimacy. The political record of Shah Amanullah, the modern king of Afghanistan and the communist government, is a proof of this political and social reality (Rahin, 2005: 2).

Many experts in Afghanistan believe that the new conditions in Afghanistan after the "Bonn" treaty are the beginning of a new and different chapter in the history of this country. Therefore, from the perspective of the inclusive government of the people according to democratic values, this is different from all the historical periods of the country. The next distinguishing point is the Afghanistan's extensive interaction with regional and international countries and organizations. Therefore, in the political and cultural literature, due to the new conditions, this course of the country's history is referred to as "New Afghanistan". New conditions

or new Afghanistan started the first phase of its modernization with the collapse of the Taliban government. At this stage, the conditions were such that the Taliban government collapsed. In this regard, the presence of The US and NATO in building the government of Afghanistan is evident.

In the second stage, the new process of democratization continued with the formation of the new system; holding the first "Loya Jirga" (the grand council) to establish the system was the beginning of this process. In the first Loya Jirga of Afghanistan, the presidency of Hamid Karzai was approved and all his ministers were appointed. The next processes of forming the system were also discussed and some decisions were made. Holding "Loya Jirga" or the grand council in Afghanistan's political and social tradition, is considered a popular action for the formation of the political system (Rezaei, 2014: 68/ Amiri 2010: 8).

#### **Introducing Hamid Karzai**

Hamid Karzai, the son of Abdul Ahad Karzai, the grandson of Khair Mohammad Khan, from the Popalzai Pashtun tribe, was born on the December 24, 1957, in the village of "Karza" near the city of Kandahar in the south of Afghanistan. He attended Mahmood Hotaki primary school

# ٳۊؘۻٳڡؿؾٳڣؾؖ؉

in Kandahar, and then in Seyed Jamaluddin Afghani school in Kabul. Later, he graduated from Habibia high school in 19761355/ AH and went to India to continue his education. Karzai got a master's degree in international relations and political science at Himachal Pradesh University (Hassanzadeh, 2010: 6).

Hamid Karzai went from India to Pakistan in 1362 AH/1983 and joined the ranks of the Mujahideen to fight the aggression of the former Soviet Union. After the defeat of the former Soviet Union from the Mujahideen and the beginning of the civil war in Kabul, the condition was favorable for the emergence of the Taliban group and Hamid Karzai continued his fight with the Taliban group as well (Andishmand, 2003: 8).

When the Taliban group assassinated Hamid Karzai's father, Abdul Ahad Karzai, in the city of Quetta, Pakistan in 1379 AH, Hamid Karzai seriously determined to overthrow the Taliban regime. He went to Uruzgan province of Afghanistan with three of his comrades to mobilize people against the Taliban to overthrow the Taliban regime (Rezaei, 2014: 8).

### How Hamid Karzai came to power

Hamid Karzai was elected as the head of the interim administration of

Afghanistan in December 2001, based on the agreement of the important and historic talks in Bonn, Germany. After some time, in June 2002 Karzai was elected by the members of the Loya Jirga (the grand council) as the head of the transitional Islamic administration of Afghanistan. After two years of being the head of the transitional administration, the first presidential election of Afghanistan was held in 1383 AH, and Hamid Karzai was also one of the candidates. Karzai was introduced as the elected president of the country by winning the majority of votes in that election (Hassanzadeh, 2010:4).

After five years of Karzai's rule, the second presidential election was held in 1388 AH; Hamid Karzai was again a candidate in that election and won the majority of votes to become the president again for another five years. His rule ended in 1393 AH. According to the Afghan constitution, a person cannot run for the third time after serving two presidential terms. Hamid Karzai ruled Afghanistan for thirteen years in four terms of ruling (alarabiya.net).

### Karzai's presidency

Afghanistan has had a constitution for nearly a century. In 1301 AH when Amanullah Khan, the modernist king

### بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنسانية

of Afghanistan, compiled the first "Regulation" to bind the political system to written regulations until the first decade of 1390 A.H., the presidential system was the only form and the only structure of political power regulation in Afghanistan. During these ninety years, the constitutions of Afghanistan have defined various systems, all of which are formally different but they have a similar nature. "Presidential system" has been the dominant form and the common nature of all these systems, which have led to a kind of "person-centered" and "single-vote" system. Thus, the natural approach to the presidential system in the "thoughts and ideas" of the constituent power that formulated the new constitution in 1382 AH, may be clearly justified by the normalized construction of power and the softened type of political system in the history of Afghanistan. This justification and attention to the presidential system is generally focused on several basic elements (Rezaei, 2014: 8):

- Continuation and experience of the royal, presidential, single-structure and totalitarian systems of the past;
- Strong political motivation to revive and perpetuate the power pyramid structure among historical claimants and hereditary trustees of the government;

- The complexity of the ethnic structure and cultural context;

- Limited capacity of political development channels;
- Mental crisis and lack of trust and national consensus based on a rational approach to an unfamiliar system among intellectuals and politicians;
- The effective presence, prominent role and deep influence of traditional and religious leaders in the power structure who want to preserve the status quo and continue the political tradition;
- Strong team support and protection of the existing power of the presidential system. On 221392/10/ AH, Hamid Karzai, the president of Afghanistan, in the parliament of this country, in response to the National Front's proposal to establish a parliamentary system, openly and strongly opposed the change of the political system and warned that he will not allow any country to change the country's political system (Yavari, 2010: 2)

After the fall of the Islamic Emirates, several groups and countries tried to remove the existing structure and create a new one in Afghanistan, among which we can refer to the Bonn Conference to rebuild the government in the country. But, for

# ٳۊؘۻڵڡٛؾٵڣؾؖ؉

the United States the establishment of a western government in Afghanistan was of great importance; and the false interpretations of Islam and the failure of the ideology of communism paved the way to realize that idea. But the inappropriate conditions to providing security and encouraging democracy almost caused the efforts NATO member countries of to establish democracy only strengthen the conditions of conflict and not the establishment of democracy (Amiri, 2010, 6769-/ Rasouli, 2009, 132).

At the end of the six-month of the interim government, an emergency Loya Jirga was formed and a decision was made to establish a transitional government, so that with its establishment, the temporary was dissolved. The government second manifestation of state building in Afghanistan was the formation of a transitional government. Transitional government as a transitional structure was meant to transfer Afghan society from one situation to another. Such a government was a political passage that provided the ground for this country to pass from chaos and shaky political systems to stable civil institutions. In fact, the transitional government was the manifestation of a change at the pillars of the political system in the country. In paragraph 6 of the general provisions of the Bonn resolutions, it was stated that during the eighteen months of the transitional government, the Loya Jirga of the constitution will be held in order to formulate the new constitution of Afghanistan. Within two months of its establishment, the transitional government will establish a constitutional commission with the help of the United Nations to assist the constitutional Loya Jirga (Amiri, 2010, 7).

### Achievements of the Karzai administration

The thirteen-year rule of Hamid Karzai brought about significant changes in the military sectors, education, human rights, democracy, freedom of speech, freedom of the media, information technology and telecommunications, and women's rights. In fact, the freedom of speech and the media has always been mentioned as one of the greatest achievements of Hamid Karzai administration. But, due to the lack of a clear policy and effective program in economic fields, foreign aid management, rule of law, fight against administrative corruption, peace process, reconciliation with the Taliban and fight against drug cultivation and trafficking. Karzai administration has always been severely criticized by Afghan political,

بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنسانية

economic and civil activists and donor countries (Jennifer, 2016: 3).

### **Freedom of Speech**

The government led by Hamid Karzai largely respected the right to freedom of speech. Many media have started working during the thirteen years and raised the sharpest criticisms against various government institutions, including the presidential palace. Social media such as Facebook and Twitter also gave ordinary citizens the opportunity to express themselves as they wanted. These media, in general, act as a monitoring tool as well as a tool of pressure on government institutions, and tried to remove the veil of human rights violations (Fanoos, 2011: 12).

However, Afghanistan was not a paradise when it came to freedom of speech. A number of journalists and civil activists were subjected to threats and violence due to their disclosures. Most media circles in Afghanistan believe that criticism of the functioning of the government and circles outside the government was mostly tolerable as long as "superficial" issues were raised, but when serious disclosures were made, there were unpleasant consequences for journalists and civil activists. In many cases, this issue has caused self-censorship and ultimately the

major violations of governmental and non-governmental officials remained undisclosed (azadiradio.com).

### Women's rights

The constitution of Afghanistan defends the equal rights of women Afghanistan has and men. also signed international agreements to protect women's rights. During the thirteen years, women became a relatively active force in the social and political arenas. According to official statistics, about forty-two percent of the ten and a half million students in Afghanistan's schools are girls. The presence of women activists in the social and political arenas has also been prominent. The Constitution of Afghanistan defends the equal rights of men and women (Mobarez, 2010: 32).

the One of most important achievements was the legislation of the law to eliminate violence against women, which was implemented by the decree of President Karzai. For the first time, this law criminalized twenty cases of violence against women and determined the punishment for it. However, the progress in securing women's human rights remained mostly on paper and its implementation in practice faced serious threats. Circles within the government institutions, including the parliament and the

# ٳۊؘۻٳڡؿڟٳڣؾؖ؉

judicial system, who tried to prevent the provision of women's human rights were not dealt with seriously by President Karzai, and the presence of women in important government and executive positions was severely limited (Saltmarshe & Medhi, 2011: 23) / Khatibi, 2011: 43).

Moreover, regarding education, most female students have been forced to leave school before reaching secondary school, mainly due to security threats and cultural barriers, and according to official statistics, only one out of ten students in universities are girls (Shafiei, 2014: 4).

The presence of women in the peace programs with the armed groups opposing the Afghan government was also dramatic and limited. Women's rights activists are worried that their achievements will be sacrificed in the government's political dealings with groups such as the Taliban and Hizb-e-Islami. Human rights activists are also not satisfied with the judicial handling of cases of violence against women, including violence such as raping. (Roots of failure and failure of nationbuilding and state-building projects in Afghanistan (mashal.org)).

### Media activity in the country

After the September 11th attacks and the overthrow of the Taliban regime,

Afghanistan had a constitution in which many of the realities of Afghanistan that were ignored or kept silent in the previous laws were clearly recorded as the legal rights of the Afghan people (https://afghanistan.asia).

The legal and judicial equality of men and women, the legitimacy of the Shia Islam, the legitimacy of existing languages, and the specification of basic rights and freedoms such as freedom of speech, freedom of the press, freedom of assembly, and the formation of political parties and organizations are among the issues for which there is a law in the Afghan constitution. Accepting these facts and recording them in the constitution also brought results in practice. Currently, dozens of political parties are active in Afghanistan and this country has dozens of free and private media. There are nearly 20 television channels, 80 radio stations, and several newspapers, weekly newspapers, and magazines operating in Afghanistan, which, according to the Afghan Public Media Law, no person or institution has the right to censor their content before or after publication.

Shortly after the implementation of these laws, there were a host of requests to the Ministry of Information and Culture from capitalists and political parties to obtain private media

### بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنستانيتة

licenses. Likewise, dozens of print, and audio-visual media were activated, among them was Tolo TV under the investment of Seyed Mohseni in 1383 AH. Rah-e Farda TV was founded by Haji Mohammad Mohaqiq, the leader of the People's Islamic Unity Party, in 1386 AH. There were others such as Negah TV by Mohammad Alam Khalili and Abdul Reza Khalili in 1387 AH; Noor TV by Salahuddin Rabbani in 1386 AH; and Zhwandoon TV was also founded by Ismael Yoon. Besides, a large number of different media have started to operate in the capital and provinces. Undoubtedly, ensuring freedom of speech and freedom of the media is considered an achievement and it was a step towards a democratic system during Karzai's rule (Ayoubi, 2010: 32).

# Activation of educational and technology centers

Before 1381 AH, women did not have the right to study and most of the schools where boys attended were destroyed due to the civil wars of the 1370s AH. After 1380, the education department began to operate in all parts of the country. Millions of Afghansespecially girls who had been deprived from education- won their right for education. Before 1381 AH, women were not allowed to work and even female teachers lost their jobs when the government of that time closed all schools for girls. During the 13 years of Karzai's rule, higher education in Afghanistan has tried to compensate the lack of human resources by educating the youth of the country. In 1380 AH, Afghanistan's higher education started its work anew in many sectors and gained new impetus (Hassanzadeh, 2010: 32).

Along with the growth of education in Afghanistan during the last ten years, this higher education in country was booming despite all the problems. According to the statistics of the Ministry of Higher Education, in the first year after the Taliban, 6,500 university students and 650 professors were busy in educational institutions, and the number has now grown to 80,000 students and 3,100 professors. Together with the students of 52 private educational institutions, the total number of Afghan students reaches 140 thousand people. The Ministry of Higher Education also replaced the old entrance exam system with the information technology system, and expanded the new computer systems in 90% of the higher education institutions of the country. This made it easier for the scientific centers of Afghanistan to be connected to the academic centers of the world. Moreover, in 2010, Afghan

### ٳ ؙٷ<del>ؘڕ</del>ڵڡۧٛؾٵڣؾؖ؉

universities had relationships with more than 13 prestigious universities in the world (BBC News).

According to the Afghan authorities, sending thousands of people to 45 countries to continue their higher education, introducing a new educational system to 12 universities, renewing and developing the curriculum, drafting a new law on Afghanistan's higher education, and organizing postgraduate education at Kabul University and the University of Education and Training of Kabul are of other achievements of the Ministry of Higher Education in the 13 years of Karzai's rule (mashal.org). In the past, female students had more problems than boys, but in 1393 AH, the National Female Dormitory for female students was established in Kabul. After a gap of 30 years, the Afghan government started issuing new diplomas in 1387 AH. These diplomas have been issued in Dari, Pashto and English languages (Martin, 2010: 3).

The salaries of university professors have been determined and implemented specifically from 18,000 to 40,000 Afghanis for 6 scientific ranks, which is relatively high for salaries. With the establishment of the new government headed by Hamid Karzai, women had a remarkable role in teaching, with more than 71,000 female teachers teaching in the education sector. Before Karzai's rule, there were about 3000 school across the country, but during Karzai's rule, more than 16000 school were operating across the country, of which 3000 were established for girls. Significant improvements were made in the quality of education. The curriculum was upgraded to new standards. Schools all over Afghanistan had professional teachers, and the capacity of educational staff improved (Mahboubi, 2013: 4/Ayoubi, 2010: 67).

Gender equality in education form the basis of individual rights, and also contribute to the economic and social progress of the society. Eliminating gender gaps in the inclusion of education and training is one of the basic goals of education and training for everyone until 1394 AH. The main goal is to make sure that all boys and girls will have equal access to education (Shahrani, 2009: 23).

Alexander Kupfer, head of the German Academic Exchange Institute "DAAD" in Afghanistan's Ministry of Higher Education, commented on the achievements of Karzai administration: "In 1380, there were four thousand students in Afghanistan, among whom there was not a single woman. Now more than 80 thousand

### - بحتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنستانيتة

students are studying in 26 state universities of the country. This is a very significant improvement over a decade." Currently, 20% of students and professors in Afghanistan's higher education sector are women. This statistic also shows a great success compared to 1380 AH (Saltmarshe & Medhi, 2011: 21) that is the result of the advancements in Internet technology, financial and telecommunication services. Afghanistan is at the top of the countries where the system of sending money through mobile phones and banking system has been provided, just like the third world countries from Kenya to Indonesia (alarabiya.net).

With the establishment of the new government under the name of democracy with the presidency of Hamid Karzai, and the provision of comprehensive global aids despite the waste of foreign aids, the country was able to improve in various infrastructure sectors such as repairing and asphalting highways, building dams and diversion weirs, and mining (Mahboubi, 2013: 21).

### **Economic growth**

According to economic data, Afghanistan's economy has grown by about 8% annually after 1380 AH, while before that the economy was declining. Even people did not have

access to telecommunication services before 1380 AH. In cases where they needed contact with the outside world, they had to travel to neighboring countries. Since 1380 AH, there has been significant and positive economic growth, in some sector, such as agricultural products, appliances and some others, the country has reached self-sufficiency. Between 1375 and 1380 AH, there was not much export and economy, while the [annual] export during Karzai administration was estimated at about 78.3 billion Afghanis [1 billion dollars]. The destruction of Afghanistan, which started from the time of the civil wars and reached its peak at the end of the Taliban regime, not only stopped after 1380 AH, but serious and effective steps were also taken for reconstruction of Afghanistan (Fanoos, 2011: 43).

With the new developments in Afghanistan, composition the of the Afghan banking system was reconstructed and the banking system aligned itself with the general programs of international development. According to the new banking laws in Afghanistan, the protection of private banks based on Article 10 of the Constitution of Afghanistan was put on the agenda of the government and the Central Bank guaranteed the immunity of private banks. The first private bank

of Afghanistan named "Kabul Bank" was established on 261383/04/ AH in Kabul and after that other banks were established such as "Azizi Bank" and "Arian Bank", etc. (Khatibi, 2011: 12).

After 1381 AH, the government intended to build a railway and started plans to connect to regional railways. At that time, based on Afghanistan's development national strategy, preliminary studies began to design and construct three railway lines, one from the border of Iran to Herat and the other from the border of Hairatan to Mazar-e-Sharif, as well as from Atamurad in Turkmenistan to Aqina in Afghanistan. Among the above three projects, the 95-kilometer railway from Hairatan to Mazar-e-Sharif was built and completed in 1389 AH, and the Turkmenistan railway from the border of Aqina, about 3.5 kilometers into Afghanistan, was built and put into operation. Three phases of Khaf to Herat industrial city railway project, have been completed so far with the grant of Iran and the fourth phase is being done funded by the Afghan government (alarabiya.net).

#### Formation of regular army

In December 2001, at the Bonn Conference, various Afghan groups and the international community agreed on the creation of a new police and army in Afghanistan. New forces were formed under the leadership of the Ministry of the Interior and defense, and they were trained to assume the responsibility of providing security throughout Afghanistan (Mahboubi, 2003: 65).

The Afghan police was divided into 8 departments in terms of structure (Rahimi, 2011: 32). Border police (border guards) were responsible for protecting the borders, controlling and monitoring the country's airports. Public order police carried out operations that require special and tactical training. Security police were responsible for law enforcement, security and preserving public order. Anti-Criminal Police had to prevent murder, theft, kidnapping, bribery, organized crime and fight against criminal gangs. Anti-Narcotics Police had the responsibility of combating drug trafficking and drug cultivation. Traffic police were in charge of city traffic regulation. Fire police were responsible for dealing with incidents. Special police forces were in charge of special operations against terrorist attacks. Totally, the number of these forces reaches ten thousand people. These were among the achievements of Karzai since he started ruling the country (Rahimi, 2011: 38/ Mojdeh, 2011: 42).

### Supporting the new political system of Afghanistan with democracy Holding elections

Holding elections in every society is a clear sign of democratic systems. Elections are of great importance because they represent the participation of people in determining their political destiny and are the main grounds for the competition of the elites for leadership positions (azadiradio.com).

The next stages were the holding of the "Constitutional Loya Jirga", presidential and assembly elections. All these steps were carried out under the direct supervision of the United Nations and the Independent Election Monitoring Commission (Afghan Institution). In the presidential elections of Afghanistan, for the first time, a large number of candidates from different parties, 23 men and 1 woman, were able to participate without any restriction or political pressure.

The presence of ethnic and political groups was also acceptable. Different groups from all over Afghanistan and Afghan immigrants in foreign countries had the opportunity to attend. Of course, the results of the elections were predictable; ultimately, Hamid Karzai was declared the winner of the election with high votes. The result of the election was predictable because Hamid Karzai was a liberal person who had the explicit support of Western countries and moderate Pashtuns, and that was all they needed to establish security and ensure the political stability of the country from the point of view of the countries involved in Afghanistan's politics (the United States and its allies) and the United Nations (azadiradio.com).

### **Democratic freedoms**

One sign of democracy is the existence of a high level of civil liberties in society. Freedom can crystallize in political. intellectual. cultural and social dimensions. Because the democratic system is based on people's consent and choice, it is very natural for people to participate in their political, intellectual, cultural and social issues without legal or political pressure and restrictions. From this point of view, the political system of Afghanistan has gone through several stages and is now in a relatively satisfactory state (Tamanna, 2014: 34). For example, during Hamid Karzai administration nearly 100 state and independent publications are active in Afghanistan. Many of them are independent and not affiliated with the government and are published with the facilities of parties and cultural and social groups. The Afghan press is free and independent in many aspects, so that they contain

### بجتلة الآداب والعلوم الإنسانيته

### ٳ ٳٷۻٙڵڡٞؿڟٳڣؾۣ؉

the sharpest contents about the government and the ruling group. The overall assessment of this principle is that Afghanistan's democracy has reached its full potential, despite the fact that it will face many practical problems. Of course, many believe that this process is the evolved stage of the previous era (decade of democracy 1340 AH) which has improved in the process of time, and accordingly, they believe that this better situation will be established and reliable. But it seems that considering the current special problems and the general situation of the Afghan society, there are many doubts about the reality of this Afghan democracy (Andishmand, 2017: 38).

# The factors of Hamid Karzai's failures in advancing programs and governance

In general, governance in Afghanistan under the leadership of Hamid Karzai has not been a successful experience. The main reason for this at the macro level of analysis is that the new political system of Afghanistan came about by a historical accident. The political system after the Taliban and its leadership were not a planned national program. In other words, the government under the leadership of Karzai was not formed with a codified national vision and clear plans regarding the development and security of Afghanistan (Heravi, 2017: 43). On the other hand, there was the US efforts for political, security and military exploitation of international aid to Afghanistan, while Afghans expected that international aid be used for the reconstruction and economic and social development of the country. The US obstructions and NATO member countries' interference in Karzai administration, and the US military civilians, attacks on widespread corruption by foreign institutions and government institutions, and the loss of national thought were among the other challenges that caused the failures Karzai of Hamid administration (azadiradio.com).

### Administrative corruption and lack of transparency in government accountability

Free media has been able to play a role in reporting corruption. Creating responsive offices is one of the main functions of governance. Governance is not only the process of exercising sovereignty and implementing the will of power, but it is the process of gaining public trust and mobilizing support for legal systems. The importance of democracy as an approach to governance can also be understood from this perspective (Seraj, 2010: 38)

#### ، مجتلة الآدابُ والعَلومُ الإنسَانيَّة

Karzai's Hamid interview on Tolo TV on Dey 3, 1391 AH, linked administrative corruption in Afghanistan to foreign contracts and asked the international community to prevent the spread of corruption in foreign contracts. Mr. Karzai said: "The big corruption today is in the contracts and transactions that are related to foreigners. In these contracts, they try to give these contracts to the relatives of government officials." (Tolo News 2011). A study conducted by the assessment department in some organizations, shows that both government institutions and aid agencies are drowning in corruption. Various types of bribes are paid to a large number of government services, including courts. For example, administrative corruption is 10% in police departments, 6% in customs and finance offices, 7% in identity card and passport offices, 5% in electricity and transport offices, and 4% in higher education (Gardizi et al, 2011).

### Civilian casualties by foreign forces

Although according to the reports of the United Nations and other observers, the majority of civilian casualties were caused by the attacks of armed groups who opposed the government, the government forces and international troops were also responsible for a part

X

of these casualties. The United Nations report of civilian casualties shows that only in 1392 AH nearly three thousand civilians were killed and more than five thousand five hundred others were injured during the violence in Afghanistan (Shahrani, 2009: 31).

On 311388/05/ AH, the forces of the United States of America bombed a wedding party in Sabzevar city, Herat province so that, nearly 120 civilians were killed. The US army issued a statement that: Afghans requested air assistance in search of Maulavi Abdul Aziz, the local leader of the Taliban and as a result of the bombing, more than thirty Taliban people and seven civilians were killed.) The Americans had clearly violated the humanitarian standards of war in bombing that village. When Hamid Karzai wanted to make this incident a press release and issue an announcement, Condoleezza Rice called him and said: We have attacked the terrorists and civilian casualties were very little...we will try in the future to reduce civilian casualties... But if you make this a press release, the USA will reconsider its aid) (Spanta 2017:243246-). Karzai reported the incident in a harsh tone. Such behaviors of foreigners caused challenges to Karzai's governance and made the bond between the government and the nation fragile.

# ٳۊؘۻڵڡٞؿڡٵڣؾؖ؉

### The interference of the US embassy and NATO member countries in governance matters

Initially, Hamid Karzai was among the people trusted by America and had deep friendly relations. However, on the path of governance, he severely criticized the US and NATO member countries' interference in his internal affairs. In 1384 AH the interior minister of Afghanistan, Zarar Ahmad Moqbel was appointed. The ambassadors of the United States and England visited every day, complained about the incompetence of the minister and the corruption in the Ministry of Interior and wanted to appoint another minister in his place. The British foreign minister, David Miliband, clearly insisted on who should be the interior minister (Spanta, 2017: 220) The United Nation decided to appoint Tom Konigs, a German diplomat, as the special representative of the secretary general of that organization in Afghanistan in 1385 AH. The ambassadors of the United States and Britain visited Karzai's office. They asked him to oppose the appointment of Tom Konigs. They told Karzai that he was a communist and an enemy of America (Ershad, 2011: 34). In fact, these interferences made the foundations of Karzai's reforms

weak and caused suspicion within the government system and challenged the governance.

### Absence of national thought

In Afghanistan, there has always been a kind of tension in the relationship between the nation and the government. The tension itself is the source of the greatest weakness and vulnerability. In this country, the national thought is weak and very limited. Therefore, the government in Afghanistan lacks a broad social base. According to the Buzan theory, the government in Afghanistan is unfounded. He writes, "If the idea of the government is not well established in the minds of the people, the government will not have a secure foundation. If the idea of the government is weak or weakly established within the society, and even if it is strong but has opponents, existing ideas can compete the with each other and the political foundation of the state becomes fragile" (Mohammadi and Dolatshahi, 2019:186). The basic problem that has provoked the minds of Afghans against the governments throughout history, are illiteracy, not learning lessons from historical events, being influenced by the religious ideology, and the interference of the countries

### - بحتكة الآدابُ والعَلومُ الإنسَانيَّة

of the region. Since the Karzai administration was established in Afghanistan with the support of the US and NATO countries, from the very beginning, some people themselves distanced from the government based on ideological beliefs. In fact, the emergence and of fundamentalism evolution in Afghanistan was after the fall of the last communist government and the coming to power of Mujahedeen. The Karzai administration, according to his paradoxical policies, was never able to provide national security, which is one of the major weaknesses of his government (Shafiei, 2014: 34/ Mahboubi, 2013: 21).

### Conclusion

The new government was formed based on the decision of the United States, with the agreement of the countries concerned in Afghanistan affairs and the compromise of some jihadi organizations that played a key role in the wars of the last three decades of the country. In order to make the new government look legitimate, they held the international conference according to the wishes of the countries that had interests in the region, without the presence or consent of all Afghan organizations, parties and groups, in favor of the majority of the members present in the meeting of Bonn, Germany (617- Azar 1380 AH), and they appointed Hamid Karzai as the head of the interim government of Afghanistan. The thirteen-year ruling of Hamid Karzai brought significant changes in the military sectors, education, human rights, democracy, freedom of speech, freedom of the media, information technology and telecommunications. and women's rights; but freedom of speech and the media has always been mentioned as one of the greatest achievements of Hamid Karzai administration.

However, in a general view, governance in Afghanistan under the leadership of Hamid Karzai has not been a successful experience. The main reason for that is the US effort for political, security and military exploitation of the international aids to Afghanistan, while the Afghans expected the international aids to be used for the reconstruction and economic and social development of their country. The US obstructions and NATO member countries' interference in Karzai administration, and the US military attacks on civilians, widespread corruption by foreign institutions and government institutions, and the loss of national thought were among the other challenges that caused the failures of Hamid Karzai administration.

#### References

- 1. Arezou, A. (2013). How is Afghanistan's National Identity. Tehran: Erfan Publications.
- Ayeezh, V. (2005). Afghanistan, a model of American democracy, from the imposition of terrorism to the realization of democracy. Kabul: Afghanistan Publishing House.
- 3. Ayoubi, S. A. (2010). Who is a journalist? What is Journalism? Kabul: Maiwand publications.
- 4. Emami, H. (2007). Afghanistan and the rise of the Taliban. Tehran: Shaab Publications.
- 5. Andishmand, M. A. (2003). America in Afghanistan. Kabul: Maiwand publications.
- 6. Andishmand, M. A. (2017). Nation-state building in Afghanistan. Kabul: Saeed Publications.
- 7. Ansari, Kh. B. A. (2003). Afghanistan in oil fire. 3rd edition, Peshawar: Maiwand publications.
- 8. Ershad, Z. H. (2011). America's strategy in Afghanistan after the Taliban. Tak Publications.
- 9. Spanta, R. D. (2017). Afghanistan politics, narrative from inside. Vol. I, Kabul: Azem Publications.
- 10. Amiri, J. (2010). The fate of democracy in Afghanistan. Kabul, Saeed Publications.
- 11. Bakhtiari, M. Gh. (2006). The roots of crisis and political development path in Afghanistan. Kabul: Noor Publications Research Institute.
- 12. Tamanna, F. (2014). Afghanistan's foreign policy in the context of regional cooperation. Kabul: Saeed Publications.
- 13. Jennifer, M. (2016). Local Governance in Afghanistan. United States Institute of Peace.
- 14. Hassanzadeh, Z. (2010). Studying the influence of the Taliban on the nation-state building in Afghanistan. Tehran: Afsoon Publications.
- 15. Khatibi, A. E. (2011). Media and Globalization of Culture. Kabul: Saeed Publications.
- 16. Saltmarshe, D. & Medhi, A. (2011), Local governance in Afghanistan: a view from the ground. Afghanistan Research and Evaluation department.
- 17. Rasoul, S. (2005). A look at the reign of Amani. 3rd edition, Kabul: Maiwand Publications.
- 18. Rahin, M. (2005). Strengthening the relationships or establishment of military base. Khorshid (2).
- 19. Rezaei, N. & Ali, A. (2014). Autopsy of Afghanistan Crisis. Kabul: Today Afghanistan Publishing Center Meiotic Institute.
- 20. Rahimi, M. S. (2011). Afghanistan Geopolitics. Kabul: Meyvand Publications.
- 21. Sajjadi, S. A. (2010). Sociology of Afghanistan. Qom: Boustan Publications.
- 22. Seraj, M. N. (2010). Twentieth Century in Afghanistan. 2nd edition, Kabul: Maiwand Publications.
- Shahrani, N. (2009). Afghanistan's alternatives for peace, governance and development, turning nationals into citizens and rulers into servants of the people. Today's Politics Journal, 5 (23).
- 24. Shafiei, N. (2009). Reproducing power in Afghanistan: explaining the Taliban's rise to power. Central Eurasian Studies Quarterly Journal, 2 (4).
- 25. Fanoos, A. (2011). Media freedom in theory and practice. Kabul: Azem Publications.
- 26. Qureshi, A. (2004). Hidden hands and public policies. Peshawar: Danesh-e ketabkhaneh Publications.
- 27. Karwal, M. (2005). Bitter and instructive lessons of Afghanistan. 3rd edition, Kabul: Maiwand Publications.
- Mobarez, A. (2010). Analysis of Afghanistan's foreign policy from Ahmad Shah Baba Durrani to Hamid Karzai. First edition, Kabul: Saeed Publications.
- 29. Mahboubi, Gh. (2013). Foreign military presence in Afghanistan and expansion of extremism in Pakistan.
- 30. Martin, M. (2010). Ethnic Politics (A. Eftekhari, Trans.). Strategic Studies Quarterly, 12 (1).
- Mojdeh, V. (2011). US permanent military bases and their effects on the future of Afghanistan. Center for Strategic and Regional Studies.
- 32. Mohammadi, M. & Dolatshahi, M. A. (2019). Explaining the factors affecting the failure of the government in post-Taliban Afghanistan under the set theory.
- 33. Heravi, A. S. (2017). Political Sociology of Afghanistan.
- 34. Yavari, A. (2010). Management in the ownership of press in Afghanistan. Resanch Magazine, 18(2).

#### **Electronic Resources**

- 35. Gardizi, M. et al, Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Department. www.areu.org.af. 2010 (1389AH)
- 36. Hamid Karzai's interview in the domestic media. Tolo News. 2011 (03/10/1391 AH)
- 37. Advances and problems during the 13-year rule of Hamid Karzai, 2014 (25/06/1393 AH) (azadiradio.com).
- 38. The roots of failure and failure of nation-building and state-building projects in Afghanistan (mashal.org) 2017 (12/04/1396 AH)
- 39. Zahir Shah and Hamid Karzai; Afghanistan's two experiences of democracy BBC News Farsi, 02/2015
- 40. Who is Hamid Karzai and how did he come to power? (alarabiya.net) 29/09/2014
- 41. 2018/4/6.https://afghanistan.asia-
- 42. news.com/prs/articles/cnmi\_st/features/2020/06/18/feature-01
- 43.https://www.bbc.com/persian/world/2011/09/110909\_132\_sept11\_naji
- 44.https://www.bbc.com/persian/afghanistan/2009/04/090407\_hestory\_of\_helth\_afghanistan